[Shri Santosh Mohan Dev]

not want to criticise any Government. We want to see that peace and transquillity prevails in that area. I flatly deny the charge made by certain Members and which has been made on the floor of the House. My good friend, Upendraji said 'zoom zoom', 'poom poom'. There are all false. RAW has nothing to do and any Intelligence department has nothing to do...

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: What is the exact name?

SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV: I do not know the exact name.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: No, no. You know it.

SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV: Vajpayeeji, the Government of India is always willing to see that any Government, whether it is a Congress Government or a non-Congress Government should survive by their own efficiency. And we are always willing to help. Please do not take it as though we are trying to destabilise any Government. It is not a fact. Rather, as a Member from Assam, I can say that probably Mr. Saikia's Government wants that we should take some action. We are not going to take any action, we want them to run the State for five years. Let people see how they can run the State. Then there will be a comparison as to what the Congress Government has done and what the AGP Government has done. The voters after 42 years are capable to decide whom they should elect. We are not at all interested. Some Members have pin-pointed some questions about certain news in certain papers. All that I can tell them is that please take that paper news with the same faith and confidence with which we have seen other papers news have played their part in the past. We do not want to go into this.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Paper news or newspaper news?

SHRI SANTOSH MOHAN DEV: Newspaper news.

Lastly, Madam, I would like to say that a criticism has been made as to why the Central team could not make a recce all over the area. And as Gen. Aurora has already said, the North Eastern terrain is so difficult. People would have asked this Central team to finish their recce altogether, I would not have been able to reply to your queries today, and then there would be an allegation as to why the reply was not given, why the Central team has not come back. We had discussed with them. And in the meantime, at the request of the Home Minister, we are very glad to say that the Governor of Assam, the Governor of Arunachal Pradesh, both the Chief Ministers and both the Chief Secretaries met in a meeting at Arunachal, and they gave a joint statement whereby they want to create a situation whereby this tension is defused. Let us share that particular move by both the Chief Ministers, by both the Governors, and both the Chief Secretaries. And let us hope that in the last week of this month when my senior colleague, Dr. Rajendra Kumari Bajpai will represent the Central Government in the talks, a decision will come. And I think this is the sense of whole House. And I take this opportunity to appeal to the Assam Government, to ABSU and all other organisations who are involved that they should come to a solution within the Constitutional framework so that we do not hear of ABSU and other agitations in Assam in future. Thank you.

II. Danger posed to India's unity and integrity by subversive, separatist and extremist activities

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now the Home Minister, Mr. Buta Singh will make the statement.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Karnataka): On a point of order.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, on a point of order. (*Interruptions*).

DR. RATNAKAR PANDEY (Uttar Pradesh): Madam,....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has not yet made the statement.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Madam, on a point of order. Earlier when you were not there, when the Vice-Chairman was there, we wanted to...

ठाकुर जगतपाल सिंह (मध्य प्रदेश) : उपसभापति महोदया, अभी तो इन्होंने पढना भी शुरू नहीं किया, प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर हो गया, यह क्या तरीका है ?

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu): Where is the copy of the statement? We want a copy of the statement. (*Interruptions*).

DR. RATNAKAR PANDEY: There must be some decorum in the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would like the statement to be distributed.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: We have not got the statement.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will have it distributed. Mr. Gopalsamy, please take your seat and read.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI BUTA SINGH): Madam,....

The foundation of the Indian State and Indian polity are the principles of democracy, secularism, socialism and non-alignment. In the last 42 years, we have evolved a broad consensus on these basic principles. Millions of our people reposed their faith and confidence in these principles and have voted into Government, both in the Centre and the States, parties which have pledged to up-hold these principles.

In our view, the national interest lies in strengthening and advancing these principles. In our view, those who act and speak against these principles do not serve the interests of the Nation. In the popular perception of millions of our people they are the enemies of the Nation.

The thoughts of our nation's leaders be speak of this. I quote:—

"Democracy, discipline and enlightened is the finest thing in the world. A democracy prejudiced, ignodant supertitio will lend itself to chaos and may be self destroyed (Young India: July 13, 1931) Mahatma Gandhi).

"India is a Secular State. That does not mean irreligion . It means equal respect for all faith and equal opportunities for those who profess any faith———. Communalism is the badge of a backward nationfi not of the moder nage.——— Nationalism cannot exist together with communalism.———Fissiparous tendencies whether they belong to Hindus, Muslims, Sikhs, Christians or other are very dangerous and wrong tendencies. They belong to petty and backward minds. Anyone who understand spirit of the times cannot think in terms of communalism" (Pandit Nehru).

"The real basis of national integration should be widely shared goals and values, commitment to what for want of a better word we call 'Indianness' without sacrificing the identity of sub-cultures. (Indira Gandhi).

There is a mass of evidence to show that certain political forces and organisations and certain individuals have acted and continue to act against these cherised principles. While the spectre of terrorism continues to haunt us, individuals and organisations have extended their support to terrorists.

[Shri Buta Singh]

Fundamentalist organisations have raised their heads in different parts of the country with the aim of destroying communal harmony and amity. There is also evidence of the unboly axis between terrorists and fundamentalists. These fundamentalist forces have received support from duals and organisations.

Fundamentalism has also given rise to revivalism and obscurantism. Individuals and organisations have espoused the alleged virtues of Sati. Policy pronouncements have been made to deny women their inheritance to parental agricultural property..

Nothing is dearer to us than the unity and integrity of India. None has sacrificed more than our brave jawans in the defence of the unity and integrity of India. Nothing can be more unpatriotic than to defame our jawans or to demoralise them. Individuals and irganisation have added their voices to the chorus of unsubstantiated allegations and have not hesitated to spread disinformation which would demoralise our Armed Forces.

Our scientists are our pride. More than anyone else, they have demonstrated our capacity to become self-reliant and self-sufficient. Our reecnt experiments bear testimony to the strength and vitality of our research and dtvelopment. Yet individuals and organisations have attempted to thwart our march towards self-reliance.

Hon'ble Members may have noticed that I have restrained myself in catalouging the words and deeds of those who would not hesitate to undermine the foundations on which we hope to build a modern and vibrant nation. It is not difficult to name such individuals and organisations. It is not difficult to quote their wirds. It is not difficult to quote their words. It is not difficult to give the dates. It is not difficult to give the occasions. Much of this is known to Hon'ble Members as well as to the people of this country. I stand before you here to discharge the painful duty of drawing attention to the grave danger posed by the words and deeds of such inividuals and organisations.

What is at stake is not a point in a debate. What is at stake is not winning or losing an election. What is at stake is the very survival of India. That India is an India which upholds the principles of democracy, secularism, socialism and nationalism. That India is an India whch sets its face resolutely against separatism, terrorism, fundamentalism, revivalism and obscurantism.

The question before this House and the people of this country is: What is the direction that we will take. The nation's interest lies in one direction—that Gandhiji, Panditji and Indiraji showed us. The hands that point to the other direction cannot be acting in the interest of the nation.

Madam Deputy Chairman, I would urge Hon'ble Members to consider these issues with the solemnity and responsibility that the occasion demands.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I have lots of names listed with me...

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN (West Bengal): For what?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: For explanation, for clarification.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: May I make a statement on behalf of the opposition?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me read out the names I have. They are Mr. Subramanian Swamy, Mr. Madan Bhatia, Mr. Jaswant Singh, Dr. Abrar Ahmed Khan, Shri Chaturanan Mishra, Mr. V. Gopalsamy, Sardar J. S. Aurora, Prof. C. Lakshmanna, Shri Anand Sharma, Shri V. M. Jadhav, Dr. Ratnakar Pandey, Shri V. Nara-

yanasamy, Shri Ram Chandra Vikal, Shri Yashwant Sinha, Shri Ish Dutt Yadav, Prof. Sourendra Gattacharjee, and some more names, because everybody has sent his name.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: On behalf of the opposition... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI (Maharashtra): On a point of order. Where is the opportunity and provision for making a counter-statement by the leader of the opposition?

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: It is not a counter-statement.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: On behalf of the opposition, I am making the statement.... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seats.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: On behalf of the opposition, I am making the statement. You do whatever you like. Madam, on behalf of the opposition.....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Are you asking clarifications?

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Just a minute. Many Members have given their names—that is true—on this side and that side, for clarifications. That is why I rose to make a statement. On behalf of the entire opposition, I say, we do not... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI (Uttar Pradesh): No other Memebr from the opposition will speak only Mr. Gurupadaswamy will speak.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me hear what he wants to say: Let me know his views. He has a right to speak. As a Member of the opposition and leader of the opposition, he has a right to speak. Please let him say what he wants to say. We cannot stop him.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: I want to say, it is a very platitudinous statement on behalf of the Home Minister. It is a general sermon, and there is very little for clarifications. That is all I wanted to say.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Let me immediately respond to the very lightly-made observations of the leader of the opposition. It is neither platitudinous nor it is casual; it is a very serious matter. The existence of the country depends upon these values, and I know that certain sections in the opposition parties are not only ploughing they are working against the fundafental principles that I have enumerated in my statement. Therefore, I would like to know from the Leader of the Opposition who spoke just now whether he could throw light on the postulates that I have placed before the House. What is the stand of his party? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: We have not got to prove our patriotism to anybody. (*Interruptions*) We don't need to have any sermons from anybody on this. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: We are as patriotic as you are. We need not prove our patriotism to you. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Madam, there is nothing to comment on this statement. We need not prove our patriotism by saying anything or reacting to the hon. Home Minister's statement. Whatever the Minister wanted to say, he has said. We have got our own opinion. Most of the things we have been saying. There is nothing new in this statement.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: As I said, I have a list of names here. Those who want to seek clarifications are most welcome. Those who do not want to seek clarifications are free to do so. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Madam, on a point of order. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. I will allow you. (*Interruptions*) Mr. Aurora, if you want to withdraw your name, you are free to do so. I am not forcing you to speak. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PUTAPAGA RADHAKRISHNA (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, he is staging a walk-out.

SARDAR JAGJIT SINGH AURORA (Punjab): I am not walking out. I am going home. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is going home without walking out. As I said, those who want to seek clarifications are welcome. Those who do not want to are free to do so. Nobody will force them to seek clarifications. They can withdraw their names. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: We have the Scheduled Castes and the Scheduled Tribes (Prevention of Atrocities) Bill, which is more important. There is nothing to discuss in this statement. Why should be waste time on this? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: I am on a point of order, Madam. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Wt appreciate the Minister's sentiments.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Madam, so far, the practice in this House has been that when a Minister makes a statement, clarifications can be sought by any one Member from each party.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not so.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: It is a well-established procedure that only one Member from each party is allowed to seek clarification unless it is a Short-Duration Discussion or a general discussion. (*Interruptions*) We are not having a general discussion here.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will give my ruling. The general practice is that when a Minister makes a *suo motu* statement, it is not confined to only one Member from each party. Any number of people can seek clarifications. Even two or three Members from the same party can seek clarifications.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: This is so only in the case of a general discussion. When a Minister makes a statement, only one Member from each party is allowed. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Madam, there can be a general debate on patriotism in the next Session. We are meeting again, I am told. Let us now take up the Scheduled Castes and the Scheduled Tribes (Prevention of Atrocities) Bill. It is more important. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Madam, I have highlighted in my statement... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Madam, we have been following a well-established procedure ... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Gopalsamy, you have said it already. I want to put the record straight. Perhaps, you were not attentive. I have said it. I have given my ruling. Please do not confuse the House... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: You are creating a new precedent. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Madam, I have highlighted in my statement, in

all seriousness the threat posed to the unity and integrity of the country by the forces of feudalism, secessionism, extremism and obscurantism. I would welcome... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Let three be a debate on nationalism, secularism, patriotism and all other *isms* on earth, in the next Session. Now, let us take up the Bill. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BUTA SINGH: I would like the House to devote full time. Let us have a debate. (*Interruptions*) These are very fundamental principles on which the sovereignty of the country, on which the very survival of the country, depends. If the hon. Members want to have a debate... (*Interruptions*) Let us hear every Member (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: If the Home Minister is genuinely concerned about nationalism, secularism, communalism, patriotism and all other *isms*, let there be a debate for full seven days. (*Interruptions*) Let us sit in the next session. Let us have discussion for 7 days. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI BUTA SINGH: There is the serious situation in the country. It concerns the very unity and integrity of the country. I want with all seriousness... (*Interruptions*). I am not here to make any allegation against anyone. I am highlighting the danger to the unity and integrity of the country. Let the hon. Members place their views. I am here to give explanation. I will also point out what forces or elements are there which are destabilising our country jeopardising the very sovereignty and independence of our country.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: There is no quarrel over that at all. I welcome the statement of the Home Minister. I demand a long-term debate. Let us sit for 7 days in a session, let us decide the ideology for this country. In that conext let us also decide about anarchism, socialism, patriotism, secularism, and all other'isms'.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, recently the Representation of People Act has been amended and in accordance with that every party has to amend its constitution stating that they bear faith to Constitution and believe in socialism and seculaism. So,, this agument is unnecessary because all the parties have to go to the Election Commissioner stating that they bear faith to the Constitution and believe in socialism secularism and democracy. All the parties' constitutions have been amended and have been registered with the Election Commissioner. 16th was the last date. So, where is the necessity for discussing this now?

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: I want to bring to the notice... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have allowed Mr. Kulkarni.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: I want to submit that the Home Minister and the Government have come forward to offer clarifications which the Members wanted to seek. A demand was made for these clarifications since last week. Various allegations were made and now the opposition wants to withdraw from the debate.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASAMY: The Home Minister has made a general statement. We welcome the statement. We can have a debate but this cannot be done through clarifications. Since we are meeting very shortly in another session, let us have debate for 3-4 days and discuss all the ideological questions. It is a very important thing, I welcome it. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. Please sit down. I cannot force anybody to take part or

[The Deputy Chairman]

ask clarifications. Those Members who have sent the names, they are free to ask. I will call the names. Those who do not want to ask, they may not ask. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE (Maharashtra): On a point of submission. The Leader of the Opposition has said that a general statement has been made. He reiterated by saying that he has nothing to say about it, let us have a debate for 7 days. Madam,, the statement has been made by the Home Minister of India with great restraint. This is not a statement in which there is any mud-slinging on anybody.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: So let it be like that.,

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: We would not go in for any mud-slinging but I want you to understand that this statement *inter alia* made with great restraint, with dignity, has one sentence in it which I think is the heart of the matter. And that sentence is, I quote:

> "What is at stake is not a point in debate. What is at stake is not winning or losing an election. What is at stake is the very survival of India."

Madam, I want to submit that it is very easy to go on trying to evade and avoid issues..... (*Interruptions*) .....by showing this kind of impatience. If this is the statement, arising out of the statement what can be the objection for allowing us to seek clarifications when the Home Minister is on record saying that what he apprehends as a result of the misdoings of these individuals these parties and thee forces is the very survival of the country. Do they want to deny or do they want us to wait for some time to seek clurifications? Every one who has given his name should be given right to seek clarifications. And, Madam, may I start off by seeking a clarifications?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me call the names of those who want to speak.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: I am on my legs, Madam, and I would have done by now. Just give me half a minute.

Madam, the Home Minister has tried to identify these people in a manner which perhaps would befit a Home Minister. But I would want him to be a little more specific and a little more definite as to which are those activities...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Please maintain the dignity of the statement. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, if you do not want to ask clarifications, you are not forced to ask.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: He said that it is a very dignified statement. Why do you bring it down to the gutter?

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI (Karnataka): It is a big farce.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: If my friend's name is not mentioned, he thinks it is a farce. If his name were mentioned, then it is not a farce.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): I want to seek some information from you.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: I am on my legs I want to assert my right.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar): On a point of order.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: The question is,, it is a good statement no doubt. But the question also is whether this statement would have come or not, despite this statement, India will survive, we will survive, Shri N. K. P. Salve need not emphasise that, anyway we will survive, ,India will sur-

vive the countrymen will survive, India's freedom will survive, not because of this statement but because of the will of the people of our country.

Madam, I want to know from you, because today it is not a point of referring to the BAC. Mr Jacob is also here. In the BAC meeting it was declared from the Government side that they will adjourn the House as usual today being the last day and as much basiness as they could transact by the usual hour, they will try to do and then the House will adjourn. Even such important issue like the Constitution Amendment Bills could not be taken up according to the statement of the Minister on the floor of this House. In the morning,, we wanted some of the Bills to be passed without any debate, without any discussion. Yet they wanted discussion. There is a Bill—the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes (Prevention of Atrocities) Bill—which is very important and if the country's freedom is to be maintained, if the country's unity and integrity is to be maintained, then those atrocities on the scheduled castes and scheduled tribes have to be stopped. Without stopping the atrocities on the scheduled castes and the scheduled tribes, you cannot maintain the unity and integrity of the country. By merely making a statement you cannot maintain it.

So, Madam, I want to know specifically how long this session will continue. Tonight how long it will continue? Accordingly, we have to prepare ourselves. That is why I want to know how long we will be sitting whether they have indicated anything to you *via* the office so that you can allot time also for the discussion or clarification or anything else for the survival of the country or for the survival of the people or whatever it may be. So, you please tell us.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have made your point. I have asked the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs to react.

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF WATER RESOURCES AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI M. M. JACOB): Madam, I am thankful to Mr. Dipen Ghosh for allowing clarifications to be sought now, because he said survival of the country and other things.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I don't mind. Whether he seeks clarifications or not, the country will survive. Doomsday has not yet come.

SHRI M. M. JACOB: Madam, according to the business today, we have listed discussion on the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes Bill which is going to come up.

SOME HONOURABLE MEMBERS: When?... (*Interruptions*)....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him finish. Why don't you allow him to finish?

SHRI M. M. JACOB: We want to take it up today and pass it today. It is no exaggeration. The Minister has also been here from the morning onwards.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: How long?

SHRI M. M. JACOB: I am making one point after another. I am making sentence after sentence. You must allow me to make other sentences also, not just one sentence. Since it is going to take slightly longer time—many names have been read out by you of Members who want to seek clarifications—immediately after that we must take up the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes Bill. We from the Parliamentary Affairs Ministry—since we thought that it will go beyond 8 o' clock—are arranging for the dinner of the Members and also the staff.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: We do not want that.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: That is for our survival!

SHRI M. M. JACOB: Including you!... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him finish.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, we are not interested in the dinner being hosted by Mr. Jacob... (*Interruptions*)... For the Scheduled Castes Castes and Scheduled Tribes Bill, four hours have been allotted according to the announcement made by Mr. Jacob in the morning.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Will that be taken up or not? Kindly tell us now.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Up to 12 midnight of 18th August we can continue. Beyond 12 midnight it will be 19th August, and the session cannot continue unless it is extended officially. So, Madam, I want to know up to what time they will continue.

SHRI M. M. JACOB: Madam, there is no problem. Four hours have been allotted. Our Members have got more than two hours' time for discussion. Our Members will reduce the time of their speeches and stop before midnight.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Madam, I want to seek only one clarification. Mr. Maran said just now that ultimately political parties are getting themselves registered with the Election Commission. They have to pledge themselves, *inter alia*, to values of secularism. It is unfortunate that after the assassination of Mahatma Gandhi, certain political parties supported the assassination. Unfortunately... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: No political party supported it. What are you talking?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is seeking clarifications. If you allow him, it will be over. so, let him finish it.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Let me seek my clarification. After the assassination of Mahatma Gandhi, sweets were distributed and there were political parties which supported the assassination of Mahatma Gandhi.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: No.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: After the assassination of Mrs. Indira Gandhi, there were people and parties who supported the assassination of Mrs. Gandhi.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: What is the point?... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: We are talking of survival of this country, we are talking of maintaining...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I don't understand this. If you don't want to seek clarifications, they want to seek clarifications, they want to seek and let them seek.

...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: If he cannot seek clarifications, can't you control him?

SHR KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan): He is making an inciting speech. Mr. Salve's speech will divide the country. That is the whole problem.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Mr. Salve doesn't understand the dangerous implication of his statement. When Mahatma Gandhi was assassinated, there were cases and now he is saying that some political parties were involved and, again, he is making another statement that some political parties were involved in the assassination of Mrs. Indira Gandhi.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Supporting. They were supporting. I have never said that they were involved. I maintain that, Madam,

Therefore, the clarification I want to seek is, in view of this...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: This is no clarification.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: My clarification is: what steps will be taken to ensure... (*Interruptions*) What steps are being taken?

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: There is no clarification at all. Can you call it a clarification?

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: In the light of the very grave threat referred to in the statement, I would like to know from the Home Minister how he is going to ensure that those very political parties... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: What is he saying? How can he say it? (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This is not the way.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I am on a point of order, Madam Deputy Chairman. What charge is he making in this House? And you are not permiting anybody. I say he is charging.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: What is he saying? That is my view, not your view. I am saying that there were political parties. What temerity is he showing, Madam? Am I to speak what he wants me to speak? Is there anything unparliamentary that I have said? Have I abused anybody? Madam, I only want to know from the Home Minister whether there are any political parties still for the purpose of.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: You have vitiated the atmosphere beyond repair. You should stop it now. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: What steps are being taken to ensure...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Please stop. In the name God please stop.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: The Home Minister showed a lot of restraint in making the statement. But Mr. Salve is spoiling that. He is taking it to the gutter level. What is this?

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Madam, I ask: what steps are to be taken by the Home Ministry to ensure that our political parties do not indulge in this kind of thing? What is it that the Home Ministry would do about it? If this threat is coming from the people who are fundamentalists, revivalists and obscurantists, what steps are being taken to ensure that this does not infiltrate into the body politic of our country? What is being done to ensure that such political parties are weeded out? That is my question.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: I will be most pleased. (*Interruptions*) Madam, my point of order is this. You have very rightly ruled that there is the statement by Buta Singhji on which clarifications can be asked. Madam, even a cursory reading of that statement will show that it contains sayings of Mahatma Gandhi and Jawaharlal Nehru on which there can be no dispute, there can be no clarification. The whole House endorses and agrees with the lofty ideals of the freedom struggle. Now, Madam,.... (*Interruptions*) You give me two minutes. You will have no complaint. Give me one minute.

Madam, the only clarification that can arise out of this statement, that the Members can ask is who those individuals are, who those organisations are, what kind of forces are operating which are trying to destroy the country. (*Interruptions*) Under the Rules of the House, unfortunately, that cannot come even as a clarification because organisations and indivi-

[Shri Kamal Morarka]

duals not represented in the House cannot be referred to in the House. (*Interruptions*)

DR. RATNAKAR PANDEY: Madam,, there is no name of any individual in this. There is the question of national integration.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Tell me why there should be any name. If I do not have the right to speak in this House, do not talk about democracy outside. We are asking, and they say, "Who are you to ask?" It is my right. You are objecting

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI K. V. THANGKABALU: (Tamil Nadu): You have to listen to everybody. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: I am raising a point of order. Please understand it. Let her rule it out. I have no objection to that.

My point of order is...

Even by way of clarification, either the question or the reply, no individuals can be mentioned, no Member of the House can be mentioned unless the rules of House are obeyed. Now, within that parameter if you allow clarifications, there will be nothing left.

Finally, we all share our concern not only for what the Home Minister has said and what Mr. Salve has said. I agree with every word which Mr. Salve has said that forces which are going to disrupt the country should be curbed. But that cannot be curbed by our having a debate, because we are all unanimous on it. The question is of action. The Home Minister should take action against all these forces. The House...

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: That precisely I have asked: What action the Minister is going to take?

THE KAMAL MORARKA: The House unanimously authorities the Home Minister to proceed. I want to assure the Treasury benches on behalf of the Opposition, the country's survival is not at stake. This country has survived the Mughals and the British. It will definitely survive the Congress Perty. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute, please. You were very concerned that we should go ahead with the Scheduled Castes and Tribes Bill. If you please—I beg of you—permit this House to run in peace and let the clarifications be asked by those who want to ask; I would be absolutely thankful and grateful to you. Please sit down.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I am thankful to you, Madam Deputy Chairman. I have not disturbed the peace. I want to... (*Interruptions*) I am on a point of order atfer having heard Mr. Salve. Mr. Salve wanted to have certain clarifications.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Home Minister should answer, not you.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Here is a sentence in the statement of the Home Minister. I quote:

> "I have restrained myself in cataloguing the words and deeds of those who would not hesitate to undermine the foundations on which we have to build a modern and vibrant nation."

Obviously when the learned Home Minister has used this particular sentence composed of certain words, certain thing is in his view that he did not want to name them, though he knows, obviously for certain reasons, for certain procedures, norms, etc. So,

I want to know whether, if somebody in the name of seeking clarifications wants to seek the name, then will he break that restraint?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot given my ruling on it. It is the Home Minister who should give the answer. If you are participating in the debate it is all right. Otherwise there is no ruling on your clarification. (*Interruptons*) I am not allowing you, (*Interruptions*) Your name is here I will allow you to speak if you want to.

श्रीमती सत्या बहिन (उत्तर प्रदेश) : उपसभापति महोदया.... (**व्यवधान**)

उपसभापति : आप बैठ जाइये । मैंने आपका नाम नहीं लिया है । (*Interruptions*) Please sit down. Mr. Madan Bhatia, kindly be brief because we have the Scheduled Castes Bill.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA (Nominated): The statement which has been made by the hon. Home Minister could not be more timely. Those who are propagating an autonomous Sikh State in which the writ of the Union will be confined only to the foreign affairs, the currency and the defence are the enemies of the nation. I shall like to ask the hon. Home Minister: is it not the fact that there is an organisation known as the Bharat Mukti Morcha, which has propagated the creation of an autonomous Sikh State to which the writ of the Union will be confined only to these three subjects and which will have the right to frame its own constitution, in which the people residing within that area may be discriminated against on the basis of religion, who may not have the equal right of opportunity in matters of employment and who may not have equal right of worship? Is it not a fact that such an autonomous State has been propagated by one particular organisation, the Chairman of which happens to be a Member of this hon. House? Till today he has not repudiated this concept which he has propagated. He has only tried merely to create a camouflage and he has tried to hoodwink the people of this country by clamouring from the housetop that he is against Khalistan and he is not in favour of Khalistan. This autonomous Sikh State is nothing but what the Anandpur Sahib resolution propagates. Is it or is it not another name for creation of Khalistan, another final step towards creation of an independent State, known as Khalistan in which the writ of the Indian Union will not run even to that extent? I would like to ask the Home Minister to clarify this position.

Secondly, Madam, I would say that those who have become the defenders of terrorists, the apologists of terrorists, the protagonists of terrorists in this country are the enemies of the nation. Is it a fact that on the 25th June when horrible killings took place at Moga, on that very day there was a meeting organised by Bharat Mukti Morcha in which the Anandpur Sahib resolution was distributed? Is it a fact that there was not a single word uttered against those horrible killings which took place at Moga on that very day? Is it a fact that the Chairman of this organisation has gone abroad and given an interview in a newspaper which is run by a person who has close links with Jagjit Singh Chauhan, who is the first enemy of the Indian people, who is the first person who wants to destroy the whole of India? Is it also a fact that.... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: Are you permitting this?

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: Is it a fact that hon. Member who is present in this House has gone abroad and addressed a gathering in a gurudwara in London? Is it a fact that he made a statement in favour of the terrorists, in favour of terrorism in Punjab? Is it a fact that he has not

[Shri Madan Bhatia]

uttered a single word in sympathy for the victims of the terrorists in Punjab? Is it a fact... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PARVAHANENI UPENDRA: Is it the level in which you want to debate the issue? You decide about it... (*Interruptions*)....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would request the hon. Member to confine himself to specific clarifications and keep the standard of the debate to the level which we are expecting.

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: Madam, you raised about this a little late. It is not fair.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: Madam, I respectfully submit, those persons in this country who have vindicated and glorified the assasination of Mrs. Gandhi are the enemies of the Indian nation. Every bullet which was fired into the body of Mrs. Gandhi was a bullet fired into the soul of India. From her martyrdom she emerged as a symbol of the nation, as a symbol of Indian nationhood. Those who stand up and vindicate the assassination of Mrs. Gandhi, are they not the enemies of the nation? I am asking the hon. Home Minister: Is it a fact that there is a Member in this House who not only defended the assassins of Mrs. Gandhi... (*Interruptions*)...

Madam, I am submitting.. (*Interruptions*)...

7.00 P.M.

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA (Uttar Pradesh): Madam, I am on a point of order.. ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: That is why I raised a point of order that restraint your... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA: He is violating the rules. (*Interruptions*)..

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: When I made a suggestion, he did not listen to me. He did not require any clarifications. The hon. Member is taking the whole thing to the gutter and what he is talking about is nothing but garbage.. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: I would like to say that... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Tamil Nadu people have thrown you out. Have some shame.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Hs is the Member who is indulging in garbage politics and he has lowered the dignity of the House. ..(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam Deputy Chairman, our time is very precious. We cannot waste this time in this way. (*Interruption*)...

AN HON'BLE MEMBER: What does he mean by garbage politics? ..(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI L. K. ADVANI (Madhya Pradesh): Madam, when I read this statement made by the Home Minister, I thought that whatever clarifications were going to be sought would be in the nature which directly flows from this. It was certainly difficult to see what kind of clarifications would be asked. But if this is the first sample, then.. (*Interruptions*)..

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: I respectfully submit... (*Interruptions*).. I have a right to say. ..(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, remind him, this is not Tis Hazari court. This is Parliament.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Madam Deputy Chairman, as I said, after listening to this, I would appeal to the Home Minister that it would be more honest to the House, more fair to the House to come forth with whatever he has against the hon. Mem-

ber to which allusion has been made repeatedly. Repeatedly, the hon. Member of the House has been alluded to without naming him. But the allusion is very explicit and therefore, it would have been fair and honest to this House for the Home Minister himself to have included all he has to say in the nature of clarifications in the statement itself and the established convention of the House has been that if there is any allegation to be made against a Member of the House, the Member has to be informed first and a clarification sought from him and here a situation is being created in which the Home Minister makes what is supposed to be a very dignified statement and Members of the ruling party are being instructed to ask for clarifications which would enable the Government to start a campaign of mudslinging... (*Interruption*) I strongly protest against this... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: I warn them, this conspiracy to malign the Opposition will not go on. (*Interruptions*). The biggest destabiliser of the country is the Congress Party itself. (*Inerruptions*) The Congress leadership is the biggest destabiliser of the country. The threat to the country's security is from the Congress Party and Government only. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV (Maharashtra): Madam, I would like to make a submission. Mr. Bhatia was midway. Let him complete. Then if they want to say anything, let them say. But let him complete first. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, I am on a point of order. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Madam, if you cannot control them, nobody will be allowed to seek clarifications. (*Interruptions*) If the Minister was bold enough, he should have included in his statement... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Madam, it is very obvious. The purpose is to malign certain Members of the Opposition and nothing else. It is very sinister. (*Interruptions*) We are not going to take it lying down. (*Interruptions*) This is a sinister design to malign the Opposition. This cannot be tolerated. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: Madam, as I submitted earlier, Mr. Bhatia was midway. Let him be allowed to seek his clarifications. (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND THE MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT): Madam Deputy Chairman,... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Minister of Parliamentary Affairs wants to say something. He wants to react..

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: What is he going to react on?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I do not know. I have not talked to him.

श्री राम नरेश यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) : मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है ।

उपसभापति : भगत जी बोल रहे हैं आप बैठ जाइए ।

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: Madam, this is a very basic issue (*Interruptions*) Everybody says the same thing. But the point is this. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, I raised a point of order. (*Interruptions*) You allowed me to raise a point of order. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: If there are elements encouraging terrorism... (*Interruptions*) They could have sought clarifications (*Interruptions*) Why are they afraid? (*Interruptions*)

Let these forces be identified. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I want a discussion on the Enquiry Commission's report on the Delhi riots. (*Interruption*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Let us discuss the Thakkar Commissions Report. We want all the reports of the Thakkar Commission. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Madam Deputy Chairman... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I allowed him his point of order, but he did not make it. What can I do? Now the Minister is there.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: It is a sinister dseign to thwart the Opposition. Therefore, we oppose him.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: Is he on a point of order? Why do you allow Mr. Gurupadaswamy?

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: My point of order was... (*Interruptions*)

डा० रत्नाकर पांडेय : सच्चाई का सामना करने की हिम्मत अपोजिशन में नहीं है और किसी बहाने **व्यवधान** .. जो विदेशी ताकतों के इशारे पर इस राष्ट्र को छिन्न-भिन्न करना चाहते हैं उनकी सच्चाई जानने की हिम्मत अपोजिशन खो चुकी है ... (**व्यवधान**) ...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: If you want to discuss this way, then let all the reports be brought before the House, let the report of the Thakkar Commission be brought before the House, and let us discuss all the reports.

SHRI DHARAM PAL (Jammu and Kashmir): Shri Lal Krishna Advani is a senior Member, a very seasoned Member of the House. But he cast aspersions that Members are being obstructed. His remarks should be expunged. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam Deputy Chairman, the point of order I wish to refer to is a very simple point of order to which reference has been made in the past and of which all Members of this House are aware, are supposed to be aware, and certainly a Member of the eminence and legal acumen of Mr. Madan Bhatia, is supposed to be aware of it. There is a rule, 238A in our Rules of Procedure. You are aware of it. The whole House is aware of it. We have been since yesterday repeatedly saying that this procedure will be followed. In fact, you will recall, last evening when you said that Shri Ram Jethmalani could make his statement under the rules after the statement of the Home Minister...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, I didn't say that. I want to set the record clear. I said on Friday you can do it... (*Interruption*) I want to make it very clear. When Mr. Dipen Ghosh pointed out, I said and in the din and noise you could not hear. I want to make myself very clear. I said that there is a procedure, let him give his name and he will be allowed. And there was no House yesterday. It could be only Friday. I want to set the record absolutely clear for everybody.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: All right, I am a little wrong; it was not yesterday, it was the day before yesterday. But the point is if you verify the record you will recall that I got up and I said that even in order to make allegations Members have to follow the prescribed procedure. Now the very brief point which I want to make for your consideration and the consideration of the House is that that procedure must be observed and particularly by the Members of the ruling party. If we throw this rules book to the winds, as they are doing... (*Interruptions*) Appa Saheb, you are a senior Member. Why do you interrupt me like this? Appa Saheb, you are a senior Member; please sit down ... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI RAOOF VALIULLAH (Gujarat): You see, Madam, they are quoting the rules... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Mr. Sinha, you people are breaking the rules and you are quoting the rules also..... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam Deputy Chairman, the point that I was making... (*Interruptions*)... the point that I was making was that no Member... (*Interruptions*)... of this House and no Minister should be allowed to make any aspersion or make any allegation or accusation against an honourable Member of this House... (*Interruptions*)... unless he has followed the procedure laid down under Rule 238A and it is your bounden duty, Madam Deputy Chairman as the Presiding Officer of this House, to see that our interests and our rights are protected and, Madam, I must say, before I end, that I regard this as a very crude and third-rate attempt on the part of the ruling party... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I request the honourable Members: Do not cast aspersions on any Member and do not take any names. Please be brief in asking your questions and kindly maintain the dignity of the House. This is the last day of the Session. I request everybody in this House, everyone: Don't take any name and please do not make my position difficult... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: He has already maligned our Member here and he should withdraw all those remarks ... (*Interruptions*)... Otherwise we will not permit him to speak ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: He has already denigrated and he will not be allowed to make any statement... (*Interruptions*)... We have been abused ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Madam Deputy Chairman,... (*Interruptions*) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute... (*Interruptions*)... All of you, please sit down... (*Interruptions*)... I have asked the Home Minister to react and that is why he is reacting. Let him say what he wants to say... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA: No, no... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: No, no... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: You kindly go through the records. I have not asked the Home Minister to respond... (*Interruptions*)... I have not asked the Home Minister to react I have asked for your ruling only, Madam... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat... (*Interruptions*)... Please take your seat... (*Interruptions*)... Please take your seat... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI B. SATYANARAYAN REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, I am on a point of order... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, I have not asked the Home Minister to respond... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You did not ask. But I am asking the Home Minister also to maintain the decorum of the House. What more do you want?... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Madam Deputy Chairman, keeping strictly in view... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI B. SATYANARAYAN REDDY: I have a point of order, Madam ... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have asked the Minister to speak now... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Madam Deputy Chairman,... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI B. SATYANARAYAN REDDY: Kindly allow me... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will allow you later... (*Interruptions*)... I have asked the Minister to speak. So, please sit down... (*Interruptions*) ...I will not allow you now... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Madam, Deputy Chairman, I am myself... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Madam, are you expunging Mr. Bhatia's remarks?... (*Interruptions*)...Are you expunging them?

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Madam Deputy Chairman, let me assure you... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: What are you going to assure... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Madam Deputy Chairman, keeping myself strictly within the procedure of this House and the conventions of this House, I would like to reply to the clarifications... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: How can we tolerate this?... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Madam, I take serious objection to what Mr. Advaniji has said... (*Interruptions*) ...I am taking serious objection to what Advaniji has said... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: What is that?... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Madam, it is very unfortunate... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: What is unfortunate?... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: What is unfortunate? You have started the whole thing and you are saying it is unfortunate... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Mr. Advani has accused... (*Interruptions*)... Mr. Advani has accused me and, therefore, I want to respond to his accusation... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Madam he started the whole game and it is very unfortunate that he did not realise the implications of his own statement... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BUTA SINGH: That a Member of the stature of Shri L. K. Advani will go to the length that he has accused the Home Minister of instructing the Member... (*Interruptions*) Madam, it is a baseless allegation... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right. I will give my ruling.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: I can very well understand the discomfort of Shri L. K. Advani. Some hon. Members are trying to expose certain forces, certain elements... (*Interruptions*).

AN HON. MEMBER: What is your ruling?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will give my ruling. Wait a minute. I have already sopken. You please sit down. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BUTA SINGH: I am replying to the accusation made by Shri Advani...Mr. Advani has gone on record... (*Interruptions*)

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA (Andhra Pradesh): Your ruling will be valid only if you expunge his remarks, otherwise not. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BUTA SINGH: I have a right to reply to the accusation. Shri Advani has accused that I have instructed that I have instructed the hon. Members on this side. Madam, it is baseless, it is far-fetched, it is not true... (*Interruptions*) I can very well understand the discomfort of Shri L. K. Advani. He is trying to shield certain elements about whom the hon. Members are seeking clarifications. Sir, the very test... (*Interruptions*)

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No, no (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BUTA SINGH: I will reply to every point of clarification.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: He should not be allowed. (*Interruptions*) Unles he withdraws the remarks he has already made against another hon. Member of this House, he should not be allowed. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let everybody sit down. Then I will give my ruling.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: Is this part of the proceedings? Under Rule 238A... (*Interruptions*) I say that the hon. Member has made these allegations, he has cast aspersions. I want to know whether it is part of the proceedings. If it is a part of the proceedings, then... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will look at the record and see if there is any aspersion or attack on the Member... (*Interruptions*) I will have to see the record.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No, no (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I am on a point of order. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. N. SUKUL (Uttar Pradeh): The Members of the Opposition party stated that they do not want to seek any clarifications. Now, what are they doing? What is this? Now they are seeking... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Unless he withdraws the remarks already made against another Member, he should not be allowed. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. N. SUKUL: Madam Deputy Chairman, I am seeking clarifications. (*Interruptions*) Have you allowed me? (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, I have allowed him? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. N. SUKUL: Madam has allowed me. Please keep quiet. (*Interruptions*) Madam, this is the statement of the hon. Home Minister ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Is it a point of order?

SHRI P. N. SUKUL: I am seeking clarifications. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: But I am on a point of order. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI B. SATYANARAYAN REDDY: Madam, with your permission I would like to draw your attention to the fact that the Prime Minister had made a speech at Red Fort on the 15th of August alleging certain things particularly against some Members of Parliament and he said, "some traitors have managed to enter into the Parliament House." So, we wanted an explanation from the Prime Minister to that effect. He must come and he must give a statement to that effect. We never wanted that the Home Minister should come and make a general statement. Today what the Home Minister has done is that he has made a general statement. We are not interested in the general statement. We want to know, the House wants to know and the whole country wants to know who are the traitors who have entered Parliament. This is the basic point. For that we demand that the Prime Minister should come and make a statement here and he must clarify. Why is he running away from Parliament? (*Interruptions*) We demand that the Prime Minister should come and he must apologise to the House and the nation for what he had said at Red Fort.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Do you want my ruling on it? The ruling is that the Government at any point of time can come with any statement. Please don't clap. It is only the rules I am reading. I am not saying anything from my side. You don't have to clap for me. It is entirely up to

[The Deputy Chairman]

the Government to come at any point of time with any statement. So the Government has come with a statement and that is what the Home Minister has done.

श्री राम नरेश यादव : महोदया; इस वक्तव्य में कहा गया है कि ऐसे लोगों का नाम, ऐसे दलों.... (व्यवधान) । उन लोगों ने ऐसे भाषण दिये, ऐसी बातें करते हैं .. (व्यवधान).. मैं जानना चाहता हूं कि ऐसे संगठन कौन हैं, ऐसी शक्तियां कौन हैं, ऐसे लोग कौन हैं जिनकी वजह से राष्ट्र को खतरा है ?

SHRI ANAND SHARMA (Himachal Pradesh): Madam, I just have a point of order to raise. (*Interruptions*) Please have patience. I am not seeking any clarifications at this point of time.

Madam, you have just given a ruling about the rights of the Government to come forward with a statement. My point of order is about the rights of the Members of this House to seek clarifications on a statement made by the Minister keeping in view the rules of this House and the accepted practice. And, are the Members on this side debarred from seeking clarifications from the Home Minister on statements of facts? (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is asking me.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Madam, if the Members quote facts, are they required to give a prior notice or give a motion?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Yes.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: No. (*Interruptions*) Madam of the clarifications emanate from the statement of the Minister which I feel is a very important statement... (*Interruptions*) ...the question is not of the subject... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Somebody is already on his legs.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Madam, this is very important because the House cannot be held to ransom and the rights of the Members cannot be snatched away by a minority bent upon creating pandemonium. You have to protect our rights. And I seek your ruling. If my question emanates from the statement made by the Home Minister and in the form of a clarification if I attribute certain facts, can I be compelled to give a prior notice? And I need your ruling on this.

(*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. I gave my ruling right at the beginning that on any Minister's *suo motu* statement, all those Members who want to seek a clarification, they have a right to seek a clarification in this House. (*Interruptions*) Just a minute. And also, whatever the statement, it is not for you to decide. It is for the Member who is seeking a clarification that he should know what he wants to ask. It is not for you to ask what he should ask. (*Interruptions*) Just a minute. You do not interrupt me. This is also no part of the rules. I give my ruling that any Member who does not want to ask is free not to ask, but those who want to ask have got a right to ask. Please do not interrupt them, and I am going to call the Members. It is over now. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, I am on a point of order.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: You have not given the ruling. No Member can have a right to malign another Member. You have not given the ruling...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You understand. (*Interruptions*).

AN HON. MEMBER: We want to know how much time it will take.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. How much time did we allot to Bodo statement? You should understand from that. You are a Member of this House. I do not have to teach you anything. Now, the thing is that the Minister has made a statement. If you want the Scheduled Castes Bill to go on, please allow the Members to ask. (*Interruptions*) What is your point of order?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, I have heard your ruling on a point of order raised by Mr. Anand Sharma. Rule 238A has been quoted by other Members while raising the point of order. Rule 238A...

DR. RATNAKAR PANDEY: Don't challenge the Chair.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Rule 238A makes it imperative on a Member to seek prior permission from the Chairman before making any incriminatory statement in respect of any other Member. That you know better than anybody else. Now, Madam, in the context of Rule 238A, the persons who have given their names to seek clarifications on the statement...

AN HON. MEMBER: Why are you wasting the time of the House?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I want to know from the Chair whether any of them has given prior intimation and thereby has sought the permission from the Chairman to make any incriminatory statement against any other Member of this House. And in that case...

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Madam, you have given a ruling.

SHRI P. N. SUKUL: No Member is being named.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Mr. Sukul, at least you will admit or rather you will concede that I know English. Even without naming a person, by inference you can make a derogatory or incriminatory statement in respect of another Member.

SHRI P. N. SUKUL: That is your inference.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Suppose we say, a Minister with turban. What does it mean? It means, Buta Singh. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Those who are teaching me rules...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: My point of order is that yes, every Member has got a right to seek clarifications on a *suo motu* statement made by the Home Minister. But while seeking clarifications, I want to draw your kind attention to rule 238A wherein it is imperative on every Member to intimate the Chairman and seek permission from the Chairman if he wants to make any incriminatory statement against any other Member, and in that case that particular Member should be given a right to reply, or permitted to give his personal explanation. So, he should also be informed in advance. I want to know from the Chair whether the persons whose names you have got to seek clarification, in connection with the Home Minister's statement, whether they have intimated to the Chairman and sought the permission from the Chairman to make any incriminatory statements against any other Member and in that case whether that particular Member has been given an advance notice that such remarks have been made and he should be given the permission.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I do not know because the question does not arise. The question does not arise up till now. I have not heard any Member's name. Did you take anybody's name? (*Interruptions*).

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Madam Deputy Chairman, the reference was very clear; not naming a Member

[Shri Lal K. Advani]

does not make any difference. When a person says that an hon. Member of this House who went abroad, and addressed a gathering in a Gurudwara, everybody knows who is being referred to. Therefore, please, the mere fact that a name has not been mentioned, the proper name has not been mentioned, is no proof even in a libel case, even in a defamation case, if the allusion is obivous... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: He has used the words, that he is a Member of this Souse. Therefore... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: Allow me fifteen minutes.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jethmalani, if you want to speak, I will allow you the time. You are a Member of this House. I will give you time. You give your name, I will allow you.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: They are going round and round the mulberry bush. Your ruling on the point is very clear that should there be any statement made, which is violative of the rules, it will be expunged by you. Your ruling, Madam, I repeat, is very clear.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: You please read the records, Mr. Madan Bhatia had mentioned... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Merely by their saying it does not become defamatory. You have given a ruling, Madam. Merely by their alleging or my alleging or anyone alleging, a statement does not become defamatory. When you read it in cold print, please find out in a calm and quiet atmosphere whether there is anything defamatory and you have given the ruling that if it is defamatory, you will expunge it. That is the end of the matter.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: The rule says that a Member making complaints... (*Interruptions*)

श्री संयद सिब्ते रजी : : महोदया, हमारे दीपेन घोष जी ने 238 ए की बात बार बार कही है, कई और मेम्बरों ने भी 238ए के बारे में कहा है लेकिन यह 238 ए रूल जो है यह इंडिपेंडेंट रूल है, यह उस वक्त के लिए है जब मैं कोई भाषण दे रहा हूं और भाषण देने के दरम्यिान मैं किसी मेम्बर के खिलाफ नाम लेकर उनके खिलाफ इन्सीनुएशन पास करता हूं, या उसके खिलाफ ऐसी बेहूदगी का लहजा या जुमला इस्तेमाल करता हूं।

यह 238 ए जो है, यह बिलकुल इंडिपेंडेंट प्रोसीजर है। यहां यह जो क्वेश्चन उठा रहे हैं इस स्टेटमेंट के बाहर निकल कर नहीं है, इसके अंदर है। आप देखिये —

"Hon'ble Members may have noticed that I have restrained myself in cataloguing the words and deeds of those who would not hesitate to undermine the foundations on which we hope to build a modern and vibrant nation. It is not difficult to name such individuals and organisations. It is not difficult to quote their words. It is not difficult to give the dates, difficult to give the occasions. Much of this is known to Hon'ble Members as well as to the people of this country."

(*Interruptions*)

I stand on a point of order. Let me finish.

"I stand before you here to discharge the painful duty of drawing attention to the grave danger posed by the words and deeds of such individuals and organisations."

मगर अब मि. भाटिया के जहन में किसी शख्सियत के बारे में, किसी के नाम के बारे में कोई शुबह उठता है, तो यह अधिकार देती है प्रोसीजर कि वह होम मिनिस्टर से यह सवाल कर सकें कि क्या ऐसी किसी शख्सियत के बारे

में आपकी जानकारी है ?ऐसे आप इस स्पेसिफिक प्वाइंट पर जो दबाव डाल रहे हैं और इनको सवालात करने से रोक रहे हैं, इसके अंदर बात यह छिपी हुई है कि आपके चेहरे से नकाब उलटने जा रहा है, इसलिए आप बोलने नहीं दे रहे हैं।

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: There is no question of name. This is a remark made by a Member against another Members of the House. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have had your say, Mr. Dipen Ghosh. I am not allowing you. I gave my ruling. Please, hon. Members, sit down; don't disturb the House. Let us finish with this business. We have got another Bill. We have to go ahead with the Scheduled Caste Bill. Let us finish it. If you had not interrupted, this would have been finished and I would have protected the right of Members; it is my responsibility. Now, no names will ever be mentioned against any Member. That I can assure you.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Rule 238 does not say about taking a name. Here is a question of a Member making remarks against any other Member... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Even without mentioning the name, it is very much clear whom he is referring to.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't make a speech.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: He should withdraw the remarks he made.

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA: Madam, I am on a point of order and my point of order relates to what Mr. Madan Bhatia has said...

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: I am the President of Bharat Mukti Morcha, and I am present and sitting here...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not aware who is President of what.

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: ....And he says the Member is present here, he is sitting here in the House. What does it mean? (*Interruptions*).

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : उपसभापति जी, खालिस्तान की मांग करने वाले... **(व्यवधान)**

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down; I am not allowing you to speak like this.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Unless the remarks made by Mr. Madan Bhatia are expunged, the House cannot go on... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is very unfortunate. Please take your seats. I am telling all the Members; I am telling Mr. Bhatia also.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: Madam, if the hon. Members are so much annoyed... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: This kind of a charge by the Congress Party against the Opposition will not be allowed to go on. (*Interruptions*)

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : आप भारत की एकता और अखण्डता में विश्वास नहीं करते हैं इसलिए इस महत्वपूर्ण प्रस्ताव जो कि मंत्री जी लाए हैं उस पर आप बार-बार हर सेंटेंस में बाधा डाल रहे हैं।

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: When the hon. Member is the Chairman of that particular organisation, he must come forward and say that he is the Chairman of that Organisation. (*Interruptions*) Why is he afraid? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Where is the Prime Minister? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: If you have the courage, you come forward and say in this House that you are the Chairman of that organisation. (*Interruptions*) If

[Shri Vithalrao Madhavrao Jadhav]

you have the courage, if you have the morals, you come forward and say. (*Interruptions*) If he is guilty, he should come forward and say that he is involved in anti-national activities. (*Interruptions*) If he has the courage and if he has the morals, let him come forward and say, instead of wasting the time of the House. (*Interruptions*)

श्री सुरेन्द्र सिंह ठाकुर (मध्य प्रदेश) : यह सब लोग हरिजन और आदिवासी भाइयों के कल्याणकारी कार्यों को नहीं चाहते। . . (**व्यवधान**) . . नहीं चाहते कि बिल पास हो। इतिहास इस बात का साक्षी रहेगा कि सदन की कार्यवाही किस प्रकार चल रही है जबकि शेड्यूल्ड कास्ट और शेड्यूल्ड ट्राइब्स के हित में बिल पास किया जाना है। . . . . (**व्यवधान**) . .

श्री विठ्ठलराव माधवराव जाधव : जो एण्टी-नेशनल एक्टिविटी चले करते हैं, उनको तो हरिजनों से कुछ लेना है न आदिवासियों से कुछ लेना है। . . . (**व्यवधान**) . .

ठाकुर जगतपाल सिंह : सर, अगर यहां कोई एण्टी-नेशनल नहीं है तो क्यों घबड़ा रहे हैं ? मैं यह जानना चाहता हूं . . . (**व्यवधान**) . .

श्री शरद यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) : या तो माफी मांगो या अपने शब्दों को वापस लो। . . . . (**व्यवधान**) . . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members I feel...

AN HON. MEMBER: Ashamed.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, I do not feel ashamed. I think all of you should feel ashamed. I am the one who did not shout at all. (*Interruptions*). I can speak in Hindi also. (*Interruptions*). I think the hon. Members will have some restraint.

It is very sad that the things have turned in such a way in a serious discussion. I had requested the hon. Members who wanted to ask clarification... (*Interruptions*). Now who is speaking?

AN HON. MEMBER: You, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Today is the last day of the session. We have wasted so much time on this discussion. I would restrain Members from creating any insinuation or making allegation against Members, or taking names. Names. You may ask clarifications and let the Minister give an answer over a serious situation. Then we will go to the Scheduled Castes and the Scheduled Tribes Bill.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Please go to the next item immediately.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Unless the Prime Minister comes, we will not allow. He made the statement from the ramparts of the Red Fort and he must withdraw the remarks he has already made. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now I feel really ashamed that while I was on my legs and I was trying to keep peace in the House and asking, please do not make noisy scenes...

SHRI SHARAD YADAV: What about the remarks of Shri Bhatia?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you were not listening to others and had paid certain attention to the Chair, I had said that I will go through the record and if anything is wrong, I will expunge it. Beyond that what can I do? (*Interruptions*).

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: What about the remarks already made? Unless those remarks are withdrawn, he should not be allowed to speak.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Let the remarks of Mr. Bhatia be expunged. Let him put a fresh query. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: Upon the conduct of an individual or organisation the unity and integrity of the country... (*Interruptions*). Individual or organisation...which involves the unity, integrity and sovereignty of India...(*Interruptions*) The truth has started pinching them. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jaswant Singh, would you like to speak?. . . I am not allowing you. I am allowing Mr. Jaswant Singh. I am *not* allowing you. Please sit down...No rules. We have had enough of rules in this House... You want to speak or not? I have already called Mr. Jaswant Singh... Please sit down.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: Madam, I respectfully submit...

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS: No, no. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: They cannot threatened me...You have to control them...I have a right of free speech...

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS: No, no.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I have already called Mr. Jaswant Singh.

AN HON. MEMBER: You ask him to go back to his seat.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is for me to decide. It is not for you to decide...No I can ask any Member to sit anywhere...Please don't dictate terms to the Chair...I will give him permission when he seeks it....Please sit down. I have asked Mr. Jaswant Singh...Please sit down. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: Madam, it is out of respect for you that I am sitting down. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Honourable Members, please take your seats. Let us not make a scene, please. I request you to please sit down. I asked Mr. Jaswant Singh to seek his clarifications if he wants.

8.00 P.M.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH (Rajasthan): Madam Deputy Chairman,... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. M. JACOB: We want to listen to Mr. Jaswant Singh... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please. ...(*Interruptions*)...I request you, please sit down. Let us behave like a House of Elders. Allow him to speak. He has been standing for the last five minutes...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Madam Deputy Chairman, I am struck that you recognized my right, though belatedly, and even after having broken the rules. I am also struck by a very deep sense of irony by a quotation that the honourable Home Minister has used in his speech:

> "A democracy prejudiced, ignorant and superstitious will lend itself to chaos and may be self-destroyed."

Madam, on the occasion of this statement, the honourable Home Minister rose from what the honourable Prime Minister chose to say on the 15th of August. The honourable Prime Minister is perfectly free to call his political adversaries what names he chooses. More than any other Member of Parliament, the Prime Minister has responsibility and has an ability to either lend to the debates that concern the nation, a tone of nobility, a tone of concern or a mean tone. It is up to the Prime Minister what tone he chooses in the discharge of his responsibilities and as he understands them. That, Madam, was the origin of this particular statement.

[Shri Jaswant Singh]

We heard the honourable Home Minister with great attention. The Leader of the Opposition indeed appropriately said that there is no one who can possibly dispute what the honourable Home Minister has said here. The statement contains quotations from the Father of the Nation, from the first Prime Minister and the late Prime Minister. It contains sentiments which we all equally share. That, however, was not the purpose of the statement, as we had understood it. We had understood that the honourable Home Minister would come forward and tell us what action they had taken against treason.

Treason, Madam, in fact, in my understanding, is not a matter for debate, it is not a matter for discussion. Treason is a matter for the Government to charge the person charged with treason and to take action. I had mentioned it to you and to the honourable Vice-President —the Chairman of the House. And indeed I said, Madam, that ever since the CAG's report came out, for the past fortnight or so we are all victims of a deliberate smear campaign. We witnessed it here, and if this body, Parliament, were to be reduced to merely a body of inquisition, of trial by voice vote, a voice of passion, prejudice and unreason, to impeach without a right to reply, and if that is what you permit this Parliament to become, as I had occasion to mention to you, Madam, and also to the honourable Chairman—and I say this in great sadness—if the House fails to receive the right direction from the Chair, then the contents of the honourable Home Minister's statement are nullified by subsequent action. We do not wish to be a party to the conversion of this House into a House of impeachment without a right to reply and where impeachment is by a voice of passion and prejudice, by a voice-vote of unreason. This House, Madam, is a sanctuary. It is not a House of inquisition. When it fails to do all this,. . .

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL (Punjab): What have they made of this House? It should not be so simple to just rise and say these irrelevant things. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: The hand of Bofors will never leave you.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: It is becoming more and more evident that the whole BJP is trying to defend somebody who has been described in this report.

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL: Mr. Jaswant Singh is casting aspersions on the Members of the House. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Madam Deputy Chairman, the hon. Home Minister found it necessary and found it fit to intervene to interrupt and to say that the BJP is supporting.

I am indeed very grateful to him for underlying two very important aspects, that the BJP is in support of the entire Opposition, and the entire Opposition is in support of the BJP, one. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BUTA SINGH: You have misunderstood. What I have said, I am going to repeat. I said that the BJP is trying to defend somebody who has been described by the hon. Members... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Madam Deputy Chairman, I would also thank the Home Minister for clarifying that wherever there is unreason, wherever there is injustice, wherever there is maligning of anyone, the BJP will be in the forefront fighting against injustice, Madam, Deputy Chairman, for the reasons that hon. Mr. Gurupadaswamy as the Leader of the Opposition cited at the very beginning and by all subsequent developments and every single pronouncement by the Treasury Benches our apprehensions are reinforced. This is not a statement which calls for a discussion.

The reasons have been well stated by him. Because of those reasons, I do not wish to ask for any clarification.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. Abrar Ahmed Khan, Shri Chaturanan Mishra, Shri Anand Sharma. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Madam Deputy Chairman, the Home Minister, through his statement, has drawn the attention of this House and the nation to a very serious development that pertains to the activities of the fundamentalist, separatis and secessionist forces in the country. It is important for all of us, whether on the Treasury Benches or on the Opposition Benches, to identify, isolate and condemn all those forces which, through their actions, are trying to weaken the fabric of national unity or giving any form of support, direct or indirect, to those who have challenged the integrity of the Indian nation-state. It is very important. I am not levelling accusations, Madam. (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will ask Mr. Jagesh Desai to take my place. I have to go and drink water.

[The Vice-Chairman (Shri Jagesh Desai) in the Chair]

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, there have been occasions to my personal knowledge— and I will strictly confine myself to the facts — when certain individuals identified with political parties and occupying responsible positions have by their actions given strength and credibility to anti-Indian forces and anti-Indian propaganda across our borders and abroad. I am reminded of the time when Gen. Zia-ul Haq was the President of Pakistan.

AN HON. MEMBER: United States.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Well, he was certainly their stooge. At that time certain leaders of the Opposition visited Pakistan on the invitation of that military dictator. (*Interruptions*)

I would like to know from the Home Minister whether it is a fact...

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: I am on a point of order.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): No, I will not allow you.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: I am on a point of order.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): I am not allowing you.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: Because he has raised... (*Interruptions*) By simply not allowing me it will not solve the problem.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): No, I will not allow you.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: You do anything you like. I want to ask on a point of order.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): No, I have not allowed you.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: I am on a point of order. The hon. Member has raised a fundamental point. I want to ask on it.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): I will not allow. You please sit down.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: You are here to uphold... (*Interruptions*) I am saying he has raised a fundamental question. I want to ask on that. I am on a point of order. I have to ask.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): I am on my legs. now. Please sit down. Only next you have the chance. You have to speak after him.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: No, I want to raise a point of order because he has raised a fundamental question.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): I am not allowing you.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: I want to ask. Why don't you allow me? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: I have not done anything to warrant his interruption.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): All right. Let him say what he wants to say.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: The speaker just now said that during the regime of Gen. Zia-ul Haq as the President of Pakistan, My question is...

SHRI P. N. SUKUL: No question. (*Interruptions*)

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: My point of order and my question is: was Pakistan under Zia-ul Haq a hostile country? (*Interruptions*) You please sit down, I say.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): You are seeking a point of information. That is wrong...

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: You please listen. (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): I have understood you. There is no point of order. It has no relevance. (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM): Just now he imputed motives to the Chair. (*Interruptions*) He said because the Chairman belongs to the Congress party... (*Interruptions*) Just now he imputed motives to the Chair. He has cast aspersions on the Chair. (*Interruptions*) I am addressing the Chair not you. Sir, he cast aspersions on the Chair. He said because the Chair belongs to the Congress party... (*Interruptions*) That should be expunged. He said that. (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): I am telling you, it is not a point of order. Please sit down... (*Interruptions*)... My ruling is that it is not a point of order. I have allowed you and I rule it is not a point of order. Mr. Sharma, go ahead.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: You have not listened fully... (*Interruptions*)... You have got to listen to it.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): No... (*Interruptions*)... Otherwise, I will have to name you... (*Interruptions*)...

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Why?

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: You listen to his point of order.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): No, no. I won't allow him. Mr. Sharma, go ahead.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I am seeking specific clarifications on matters of vital importance. I would like to know from the Home Minister the names of those Indians who visited Pakistan at the invitation of late Gen. Ziaul Haq in March, 1984?... (*Interruptions*)...

DR. BAPU KALDATE (Maharashtra): Mr. Salve was there. The Government of India has sent a delegation.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Subramanian Swamy was there.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Ministers are going there.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): What is wrong in it? It is for the Home Minister to clarify if he wants to clarify; otherwise he will reject it... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: I am referring to a time when there was a direct support to terrorists from across the border, when there was a build-up of terrorism immediately before Operation Blue Star. The Government was compelled to take action at that time. These people addressed press conferences in Islamabad and Lahore. There was not a single word of criticism or condemnation about support to the terrorists. May I know whether it is a fact that they utilised that opportunity to condemn the then Prime Minister, Mrs. Gandhi and the Government of India? May I also know whether they were the same individuals who visited the Golden Temple when late Bhindranwale was entrenched there and gave a clean chit to him saying that no arms had been stored and he does not have any diabolic intentions? I am asking about their identity. May I also know whether they were the same individuals who have condemned the IPKF?... (*Interruptions*)... You ask your Karunanidhi.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Aspersion is the order in the country today. ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: They have killed the Tamils more than the Sinhalese army.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Mr. Gopalsamy, please sit down. I am so liberal; even then you are doing like this.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: If he utters a word about that I will react.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Go ahead, Mr. Sharma.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: I want to know the identity of those who have spoken the language of Amnesty International to denigrate and castigate the Indian Armed Forces. As an Indian I am proud of the Indian Armed Forces.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Because your Indian army has killed innocent Tamils in Sri Lanka. (*Interruptions*) ...You are responsible. This Government is responsible. Mr. Rajiv Gandhi is responsible. ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Sir, any comments against the IPKF must be expunged. That is completely outside the debate. We are not discussing it. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, stop this further. It is enough. Please stop this here. (*Interruptions*)... What do you want to gain? (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, you are inviting trouble. (*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Their names are with me. I cannot stop them. I have no business to stop them. (*Interruption*)... Once their names are with me, I cannot stop them. But I will ask them to be as brief as possible.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: My next clarification pertains to Jammu and Kashmir. We are worried about the developments there, the activities of organisations like JKLF, JKJE and the People's League and the leaders of these organisations are also members of the MUF. I want to know the names of those parties which support the MPF in the country and whether

[Shri Anand Sharma]

the activities of the constituents are not detrimental to the unity and integrity of the country.

My last clarification is, who are the people who are controlling the Havelock Road Gurdwara in Southall in London? Is it not controlled by the International Sikh Youth Federation which is openly propagating the cause of Khalistan? Number two, whether the newspaper Desh Pardesh managed by Purewal is not, in fact, controlled by Jagjit Singh Chauhan and is today the mouthpiece of Wasan Singh Sabharwal and Gurbachan Singh Manochahal. About the Third World Broadcasting Corporation in America, is it not a fact that it is funded by the ISI of Pakistan and in November 1987 a 'Pakistani astrologer on that Broadcasting Corporation had predicted that the next assassination attempt on the Indian Prime Minister would be successful? Is it not a fact? That is what I want to know and the identity of a very responsible leader who condemned operation "Black Thunder" which in fact. was aimed at restoring the dignity of the Golden Temple and whether that individual happens to be the same person who has misutilised the occasion of the Independence Day to demoralise the Indian Armed Forces... (*Interruptions*)..

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: What he is talking about?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): No, no. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: It is all nonsense... (*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): I condemn this behaviour. I condemn his vehemently. This must go on record. (*Interruptions*)

Mr. Sukul, you ask your clarifications.

SHRI P. N. SUKUL: Sir... (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): All of you please go back to your seats. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: How long do you go on like this? Let there be a closure of the debate. (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Please go back No, this is not the way. Please sit down. You should stop this kind of behaviour. (*Interruptions*) Go back to your seats... (*Interruptions*)... Please go back to your seats... (*Interruptions*)...All of you, go back to your seats... (*Interruptions*)... All of you, go back to your seats... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI P. N. SUKUL: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir,... (*Interruptions*)....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): All of you, go back to your seats... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI P. N. SUKUL: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, firstly, I want to know from the honourable Home Minister whether, while "Operation Black Thunder" was acclaimed by certain international leaders, it was condemned by some of the Opposition Chief Ministers... (*Interruptions*) and secondly,... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Sir, I move that this debate may be closed... (*Interruptions*)... I move that this debate may be closed... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI P. N. SUKUL: I want to know whether some people have demanded that article 370 should be extended to Punjab also... (*Interruptions*)...Sir, I also want to know whether, after the assassions of Mrs. Indira Gandhi were convicted, some Opposition leaders pleaded for clemency for them and that is how the Opposition leaders... (*Interruptions*) ...are encouraging the terrorists... (*Interruptions*)... These are the things that I want to know from the honourable Minister... (*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): All of you, go back to your seats... (*Interruptions*)... You cannot dictate to me... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Let me explain... (*Interruptions*)...Let me explain... (*Interruptions*)... You have to listen to me; you have to listen to me... (*Interruptions*):...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): No... (*Interruptions*):

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, he should be allowed to speak... (*Interruptions*)...Mr. Upendra should be allowed to speak... (*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): No, no... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, the statement made by the honourable Minister about the danger posed to India's unity and integrity by subversive, separatist and extremist activities is welcome... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: For heaven's sake, please close this debate... (*Interruptions*) ...For heaven's sake, please close this debate ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I am thankful to the hon. Home Minister... (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): This will not go on recrod. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: Secondly, may I know from the hon. Home Minister who has denied the right of women in agricultural property... (*Interruptions*)

Another important thing is that nothing can be more unpatriotic than demoralising our jawans. May I know from the hon. Home Minister, who is the person who is organising, who is that individual who is playing an anti-national role by demoralising our jawans of the Army?

Another clarification which I would like to seek its that some individuals or organisations have thwarted our march towards self-reliance. May I know from the hon. Home Minister who are responsible for this? (*Interruptions*)

Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, another important thing I want to know... (*Interruptione*)...communal speeches of Bal Thakre, Shiv Sena chief.. (*Interruptions*)... He should be (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: We do not want it. Please close it (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Mr. Home Minister. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: I beg of you to close this debate. (*Interruptions*) We do not want any reply from the Home Minister. (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Please sit down. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: We do not want any reply.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): But the hon. Member who spoke wants... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir,...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Nothing will go on record except the reply of the Home Minister. (*Interruptions*)

After the statement if you don't allow the Home Minister to reply,

[Shri Jagesh Desai]

nobody will forgive us. You are setting a very bad precedent. This is very unfair on your part. He should be allowed to reply to the clarifiations.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, the hon. Members have asked for some clarifications. I must say that the hon. Membres want some information. Shri N. K. P. Salve wanted to know whether certain political parties had distributed sweets at the time when Mahatma Gandhi was assassinated. Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir... (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Nothing will go on record except Mr. Buta Singh. Those whom I have allowed, they will go on record, those who have not been allowed, they will not go on record.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Sir, it is a matter of report... (*Interruptions*)... that certain communal elements who were opposed to Mahatma Gandhiji during his life time were at the back of the assassination of Mahatma Gandhi... (*Interruptions*)... and they distributed sweets. And it was also a matter of report that the houses of some of the leaders of that particular organisation were burnt in Nagpur and other places in Maharashtra. (*Interruptions*) So far as Mrs. Indira Gandhi is concerned... (*Interruptions*)... it is an open secret that in certain parts of the country, in Punjab and elsewhere, certain groups did distribute sweets on the assassination of Shrimati Indira Gandhi... (*Interruptions*)... Sir, it is also a matter of report that certain organisations did organise the defence of the assassins of Mrs. Indira Gandhi. (*Interruptions*) Some of the leaders of the Opposition, a so-called eminent lawyer, he himself defended the assissins of Mrs. Indira Gandhi. I would like to say... (*Interruptions*)... the Supreme Court... (*Interruptions*)... at the end... (*Interruptions*)...

(**The Deputy Chairman** in the Chair)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't behave like this. It is very unfortunate. Please sit down. Mr. Buta Singh will make the reply. He has come for us. Please sit down. He will make the reply. He has to. You are nobody to decide who will speak in this House or who will not. (*Interruptions*) You are a new Member. Go back to your seat.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Madam, Deputy Chairman, I was saying... (*Interruptions*)... that the assassins of Mrs. Indira Gandhi were not only defended and supported, but their... (*Interruptions*)... cause was furthered, their cause was taken to foreign countries by the same leader of the Janata Dal who defended them in India. (*Interruptions*) And he said that while doing that he has done a great service to the Sikh Community. Therefore... (*Interruptions*)... it is my answer to the clarification of Shri Salve and Shri Bhatia about the assassins of Smt. Indira Gandhi. (*Interruptions*)

Madam, Shri Bhatia wanted to know whether the President of Bharat Mukti Morcha has propogated the formation of a Sikh homeland. My information is that yes, the President of Bharat Mukti Morcha on the 6th of November, 1988 in Chandigarh participated in a seminar, called the 'Analysis and Solution of Punjab Problem' concluded here—that is in Chandigarh—and Mr. Jethmalani, President of Bharat Mukti Morcha... (*Interruptions*)... for creation of autonomous Sikh State within the Indian Union as the solution to the Punjab problem... (*Interruptions*). The leader of the Janata Dal, Mr. Jethmalani, denigrated the Government of India... (*Interruptions*)... on the killings of the innocent people in Punjab in his interview with the... (*Interruptions*)...

About the clarifications sought by Shri Madan Bhatia,... (*Interruptions*) ...that the same leader, the President of Bharat Mukti Morcha, on the 25th of June, when Moga killing took place... (*Interruptions*). It is a fact that on the same day, he was in Chandigarh and did not mention about the gruesome killing in Moga... (*Interruptions*)...that certain leaders of the opposition went to Pakistan... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: What the Home Minister said is absolutely ...(*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I do not know if you could hear it.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: If you have not heard it, then how is it going on record? Is it going on record or not? If it is going on record, whether what he is saying is within the rules of the House, and is parliamentary.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If the Home Minister says anything which is unparliamentary, responsibility is of you all because you are not allowing me to hear what he says. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI BUTA SINGH:.. and killing of innocent people...and also terrorism in Jammu and Kashmir. Madam, secessionists specially the MUF are being actively supported by a senior leader of the Janata Party, Mr. Mufti Mohamad Sayeed... (*Interruptions*). It is very unfortunate that leader of the so-called Janata Dal, leader of the opposition Mr. Biju Patnaik... (*Interruptions*) ...condemned IPKF which has done a yeoman service in discharge of national duty in Sri Lanka which earned it wholehearted appreciation of the Government of India and Congress Party. Mr. Anand Sharma asked me whether a leader of the Opposition gave an interview ... (*Interruptions*) to a T.V. ...(*Interruptions*) centre... (*Interruptions*)...in America. (*Interruptions*) Yes. (*Inerruptions*) Mr. Jethmalani did give an interview... (*Interruptions*)... Khalistani activities in America... (*Interruptions*)...I have the full... (*Interruptions*)...The Government of India and the Punjab Government who are fighting against terrorism in Punjab ...(*Interruptions*)...openly supporting the cause of Khalistan .(*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Anything said without my permission will not go on record. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BUTA SINGH: One of the Chief Ministers of the Opposition... (*Interruptions*) Mr. N. T. Rama Rao ...(*Interruptions*)...the Government of India and the Punjab Government ...(*Interruptions*) Mr. N. T. Rama Rao... (*Interruptions*)...wanted to know...whether some of the Opposition leaders... (*Interruptions*) They have pleaded for mercy for the murderers of Shrimati Indira Gandhi... (*Interruptions*)...wanted to know... who is the Chife Minister who wanted to take away the right of women. (*Interruptions*) Madam, unfortunately, it is the Chief Minister of Haryana, Mr. Devi Lal, who wanted to take away the right of women in Haryana. (*Interruptions*) These are the elements... (*Interruptions*) Certain groups, certain individuals, are cutting at the very root of the unity of the country. (*Interruptions*) I am pained that I have to take the names... (*Interruptions*)...deputies of some of the reactionaries, deputies of some of the agents, who are playing with the unity... (*Interruptions*) Mr. Jaswant Singh wanted to know whether we are taking some action... (*Interruptions*) But all means, we will... (*Interruptions*) these elements to play with the unity of the country. Thank you. (*Interruptions*)

9.00 P.M.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please, go back to your seats. (*Interruptions*) Hon. Members, now take your seats, go back to your seats.

I am very unhappy and pained at what happened today in the House on a matter which is so serious.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: You have given enough sermons. We know how to conduct the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not listening. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI M. S. GURPADASWAMY: It is an insult to the Parliament.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am now taking the Scheduled Castes and the Scheduled Tribes Bill.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: On a point of order. The Parliamentary Practice is that the Reporters *i.e.* the stenographers should report what they hear with their own ears. Like all of us the Reporters could not have heard a single word uttered by the Home Minister as it was drowned by the din and noise. But now I have seen with my own eyes how his junior Minister has come to the Reporter's Table and given his written speech for record. This is against Parliamentary Practice.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: They should write whatever they have heard. Nothing else should go on record. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please, do not manhandle our Secretariat staff.

AN HON. MEMBER: What papers have they snatched from here? We want to know that.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA (Bihar): Madam, you must condemn.

THE DEPUT CHAIRMAN: Only after you sit down. I can speak. Please take your seat.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: You take action... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would request Mr. Talari Manohar to return the speech... (*Interruptions*)...

The House is adjourned for fifteen minutes.

The House then adjourned at six minutes past nine of the clock.

The House re-assembled at twenty-nine minutes past nine of the clock, The Vice-Chairman (Shri V. Narayanasamy) in the Chair.

STATEMENTS BY MINISTERS

II. Danger posed to India's Unity and Integrity by Subversive, Separatist and Extremist activities— contd.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY): Now we are adjourning the House for half-an-hour for dinner and then we will re-assemble for discussion on the Bill.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Before we adjourn...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY): I am adjourning the House now. You can raise your point after we meet again.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Before we adjourn, just a minute.

SHRI MIRZA IRSHADBAIG (Gujarat): It has adjourned already. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: I will take just one minute before the House is adjourned. I am not raising anything pertaining to this. (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY): You can raise the issue after we meet again.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: I am not referring to any issue. (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY): One minute. I am telling you. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Please allow me one minute. (*Interruptions*).